

Chapter 4

Conclusion and Discussion

4.1 Conclusion

The conclusions are as follows:

- (a) Both provinces showed similar trends in education completion, with each younger age group completing more education than each older age group.
- (b) There was strong reduction in high education among age group 20-44 in both provinces.
- (c) The 'male other' group had the highest proportion in elementary level and secondary level completion, while the lowest proportion was found among female Muslims.
- (d) The 'female other' group had the highest proportion who completed 'high level' education, in both provinces, while the female Muslims in Pattani and male Muslims in Songkhla were the categories lowest for completing 'high' education.
- (e) There was a strong association between education completion and demographic factors, with female Muslims having the lowest probability of education completion. For the age groups studied, it was found that the younger the age group the higher the probability of education completion. For districts, the city areas in both Pattani and Songkhla had the highest probability of education completion.
- (f) Secondary school completion rates can be modelled using logistic regression with quadratic representing age groups.
- (g) For a forty-years period (1960-2000), the proportion of secondary education completion in both provinces increased among all gender-religion groups.
- (h) In 1960, the highest proportions of secondary school education completion in both

provinces were for male other and female other group in the City district.

- (i) For the Islamic groups, the proportions of secondary school education completion were very low in all areas, particularly in NongChik district for Pattani and SabaYoi for Songkhla (less than 30%).
- (j) Students in Thailand are usually encouraged to continue on from elementary education to complete secondary education. This appears to have some justification in light of the findings, of this study, that completing 'no education' led to less likelihood of being employed, and completing a 'high' level of education led to a greater likelihood of being employed, when both were compared to having completed only elementary education.
- (k) However, in this study it was found that in Songkhla Province that there was no significant employment advantage in completing secondary education and in Pattani there was actually a statistically significant disadvantage for gaining employment, based on comparisons with completion of elementary education only, associations measured by Odds Ratios. The finding for Songkhla was surprising. It was even more unexpected to find that in Pattani the completion of secondary education was associated with the highest rate of unemployment, higher than for those who had completed elementary education and also higher than for those with no education completed.
- (l) Economic bases and occupational structures in these two provinces might explain some of the findings, however, in Pattani the unexpected findings for those completing secondary education were found to apply to the Muslim population but not to the non-Muslim population in that province. Therefore religious affiliation appears to have some relevance to the relationship between education and employment. Within each religion, no group showed statistically significant gender difference.

4.2 Discussion

The analysis of Odds Ratio for the association between education completion and age groups (Figure 3.1) revealed that the trend was similar in both provinces. The younger age group completed more education than an older age group. But for the high education in the age group 20..44, there was a decrease similar in both provinces. This was because of the use of the National Educational Plan Issue 4th (1972-1981); system 6:3:3 (Elementary : Secondary : High School) instead of The Issue 3rd (1972-1976); system 4:3:3:2 (lower elementary : higher elementary : lower secondary : higher secondary) (WWW.secondary.kku.ac.th/crr-dev/variety/hist.htm , 2006) since the 3rd one allowed the students who finished 3 years of lower secondary and 2 years of higher secondary to continue on to 'high education'. Those who did not continue on to high education mostly continued studies in their vocational school. This research treats the vocational study as high education. The strategy of the National Educational Plan Issue 4th is that students have to pass 3 years higher secondary (an additional year) before continuing their high education. Since then, in addition, the vocational study has become less popular among students. The situation has stayed the same until the present time.

The analysis for the association between education completion, gender and religion by Odds Ratio plot (Figure 3.2) found that there was a similar trend of elementary and secondary completion in both provinces. The male other group had the highest proportion number follow by female other, male Islam and female Islam respectively. But for people who completed a high level of education it was found that female other had higher than any other group, while the lowest proportion was female Islam in Pattani and male Islam in Songkhla. The reason of the study found because that most male and female Muslims in Songkhla and Pattani who had completed the compulsory elementary educational level go to private religious teaching schools, or Ponoh. Because the religious schools mainly teach religion,

these students cannot continue education at university level due to lack of background in other subjects. There are few universities in Thailand which emphasize teaching religion. Thus it is difficult for them to compete with other students who have more knowledge in other subjects for entrance to universities (Ministry of Interior, 2005). However, the results are inconsistent with a study conducted by Mandana Hajj and Ugo Panizza (2008) in Lebanon. They found that girls (both Muslim and Christian) tend to receive more education than boys and that is no difference between the education gender gap of Muslims and Christians.

The analysis by Odds Ratio of education completion in each district found that in both provinces people well educated lived in City areas. The results from this study may indicate the availability of transportation and educational management systems for people in that area. Areas with higher numbers of educated people are mostly urban, where transportation and a variety of educational management systems are available. The results agreed with a study conducted by Tassanee Prompaichit (1998) who found that environmental factors (the convenience of transportation between house and school) had an effect on educational level of people in that area.

The study in the trend secondary education completion in Pattani and Songkhla Provinces found that, the secondary school completion rates can be modeled using logistic regression with representing age groups. The proportion of secondary school education completion plotted against age based on the logistic found that, in 1960 people of both provinces who lived in urban area (Pattani city district for Pattani and Songkhla city district and Hat Yai district for Songkhla) showed the highest education completion. This might be because there were more schools there than in the other areas, and also because of easier travel. However, in 2000 (40 years later) we found that male and female other groups in Pattani had the lowest in secondary education completion. One reason might be linked to Pattani having the biggest

fishery industry in Thailand. There were immigrations of non Muslim labour from other areas especially from the Northeast of Thailand, and this group of labour might not have pay attention to education while the other areas in Pattani were supported in education and communication by government. For Songkhla, male and female Muslims in SabaYoi district had the lowest secondary education completion. The reason for this may be that most of SabaYoi area is mountains, so the travel is not convenient.

The individual's level of education is an important determinant of occupational success (Isengard, 2003), and in Thailand there is a compulsory education scheme until the end of elementary education, at grade 6 level, and usually encouragement to continue on to complete secondary education. In most parts of Thailand most students may enter public or private secondary school after completing elementary education. The curriculum of the secondary education was designed to offer various fields of academic knowledge as well as fundamental occupational skills students can use as a basis for working in their future careers. Findings of this study in Pattani and Songkhla provinces are partly in agreement with Isengard's statement and partly inconsistent with it: partly showing that employment is an incentive for completing more education but also revealing some disincentive. At the extremes of 'no education' and 'high education', there was general agreement, but an intermediate level of education (secondary education) did not significantly increase likelihood of employment in either province, when compared with elementary education only (OR = 1.348 for Pattani, and 0.997 for Songkhla).

The statement by Isengard, and assumptions of a positive association between education level achieved and improved employment outcomes, were made in the context of western post-industrial economies where education is needed for entry to specialized service sector employment and where relatively few people work in agriculture. This contrasts with the situation in parts of southern Thailand, at least in both Pattani and Songkhla provinces, where

the percentages of the labour force employed in agriculture were approximately 42.6% and 34.0%, respectively (From Table 1.2). Experience and skills from working in agriculture, rather than the completion of secondary education, might be more valued and more likely to lead to employment in agricultural occupations. The relatively high dependence on employment in agriculture in the region might be part of the reason why completion of secondary education appears to be of little or no employment advantage in the two provinces. This possible explanation, that the agricultural economic base of these provinces, especially of Pattani Province, leads to secondary education being of little, or even negative, value for employment, could be further tested by examining age distributions in various occupations and so invites a follow-up study. It would also be useful to investigate the supply/demand situation for workers in agriculture and other sections in Pattani, and whether or not secondary education raises work goals to a point where some choose unemployment rather than laboring work. Differences between the two provinces deserve attention. In Pattani those who had completed a secondary education were actually more likely to be unemployed, more likely than for any other level of education. There are differences in the economic bases and occupational structures of the two provinces. In Pattani, compared to Songkhla, a greater proportion of the labour force is involved in agriculture and a lower proportion is in professional positions (18.5% compared to 24.1%). Both provinces have some employment opportunities for professionals, providing employment for some who complete the 'high' and 'secondary' levels of education required for entry to these occupations, but this was more-so in Songkhla. If true, then together these points might explain some of the variation between Pattani and Songkhla, in the results of this study.

Even if the economic structure is a factor, it cannot fully explain all of the differences between the provinces. In Songkhla Province there was no clearly statistically significant relationship between the level of education (elementary or secondary) completed and

unemployment, for any gender or religious group. However, in Pattani Province the Muslims differed from non-Muslims in employment outcomes associated with secondary level of education. Figure 3.8 reveals that, in Pattani it is Muslims, not non-Muslims, who are more likely to be unemployed after they have completed secondary education when compared to those who completed only elementary education. In Pattani Province in general, completing secondary education after elementary education made it less likely that unemployment would be avoided, however, in some districts completing secondary education clearly was an advantage in gaining employment, at least for the non-Muslim segment of the population. In three districts of Pattani Province (Mayo, ThungYangdeang and Kapho) none of the non-Muslim population who had completed secondary education were unemployed. Most of the population in Pattani is Muslim whereas most of the population in Songkhla is non-Muslim, but this study did not examine the significance of the relative ratios. Various aspects of Muslim culture in southern Thailand deserve further attention. One is that a significant and increasing proportion of Muslim students attend Muslim secondary schools in Pattani Province. The question of whether or not the different curriculum in those schools influences employment prospects invites further study.

The data from the 2000 Population Census of Thailand was used in this study. Therefore, the results in relation to unemployment might be limited unless other research findings are taken into consideration. According to the report “The problem of unemployment in the southern bordered provinces” of the Ministry of Labor, unemployment in the southern border provinces is not merely the result of the economic and politic crises. The study found that the problem of unemployment in Pattani and Songkhla might not be the same as in the other areas in Thailand

(http://www.isranews.org/cms/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=4134&Itemid=86).

In 2004-2005, the level of unemployment in Pattani and Songkhla was one of the top ten of Thailand. In 2004, Songkhla had the highest level of unemployment (3.82%), and Pattani the seventh highest (2.39%). In 2005, Songkhla had the fifth highest (2.41%) and Pattani the tenth highest (2.11%). This indicates, over those years, some improvement in levels of employment relative to other provinces. In Songkhla a 'regular' unemployment situation was seen to exist, with unemployment being the result of there being more people seeking jobs than the number of jobs available: the number of positions was less than the number of employees. In contrast, in Pattani, there were some vacancies. Some employment positions had not been filled even though significant numbers of workers had been unemployed. Of this situation, Mr. Arpron Am-matavech, the Head of the Department of Labor, Pattani, said that unemployed people in Pattani have three behaviors or attitudes in approaching work (<http://72.14.235.132/search?q=cache:ZBUYkkGlrAgJ:service.nso.go.th/nso/nsopublish/service/data/topten/labor/T0223/th/th.htm>).

1. Don't like a dirty job, so they avoid it.
2. Don't like to work near tempting places, because it is against the religious rules.
3. Don't like to work in big commercial fishing. The biggest fishery in Thailand is located in Pattani. Some boats sail from the coast for many days with such absences from family and friends not popular among all potential workers. Also, most of the fishing boats' owners are Buddhist so they are not perceived as likely to ensure that it is convenient for Islamic workers to undertake their religious activities.

In addition, the Department of Provincial Labor provided many job training projects to people, but there were very few who attended. For example, the government invested in the metal welding worker training project, and planned to send the trainees to work in Middle-Eastern countries after training, however, the government couldn't continue this project because there were very few trainees. So, in the study about the factors which impact on the

unemployment of people in both provinces, specific variants such as the above should be considered.

4. 3 Recommendations for application and further research

4.3.1 Research application

- 1) Among lower secondary students there should be more promotion of chances to take further studies at the vocational level. From the research, the new system of education leads those lower secondary students (grade 9) to plan much more studying in academic field since the change of the education system from 4:3:3:2 to 6:3:3. As a result, the amount of vocational students has reduced sharply. Its impact affects the supply of well-trained labour force in the middle level, needed to develop the country.
- 2) There is an urgent need to promote more education opportunities among Islamic male and females. The research found that this group of people lacks of opportunities more than other groups, and it also found that the lack of education affects the opportunities in finding jobs.
- 3) The study illustrates the link between education and employment of people in Pattani and Songkhla Provinces. It also found that the graduation of people effects the working students for those in the two provinces.
- 4) Most population in Pattani are Muslims who have strong religious values, who wish to learn about religion and so frequently enroll students in a private school. Provision of Islamic Studies in the curriculum of all those government schools which have Muslim students might encourage them to take further studies in government institutes.
- 5) Students are prompt to take higher studies if it helps to find a right job later, so the

government should initiate and manage additional courses both in the academic field and in vocational areas of the curriculum, where they are clearly linked to employment opportunities.

4.3.2 Further study

- 1) Study more about how particular career groups are related to graduation levels. Compare them in both provinces.
- 2) This study focuses only on comparison of the working status between secondary and primary levels. It should study more in other levels eg. primary/none and high/secondary in every gender and religion.
- 3) The study found that with the changing of the education system in Thailand from 4:3:3:2 to 6:3:3 there followed a recorded decrease in participation in 'high' education, probably due to categorization changes and not to reduced participation in university education. The changed Education Plan encouraged participation in university education but possibly contributed to lower participation in vocational education and a lack of middle workforce skills. In any further studies there should be separate analysis of the working status of two age groups to compare them. The two groups are those whose ages are between 25-44 who come from the new education system (6:3:3) and the group of 45-59 years old who are from the old education system (4:3:3:2). The results should show more clearly the outcomes for graduates who finished their studies at a high level, comparing those from two different educational systems.

4.4 Limitation of study

- 1) Aspects of the data base on the 2000 Population and Housing Census of Thailand were

analyzed. So, the results and discussion of this study only refer to the situation in 2000 and changes in society since that census mean that the results of this study might be a useful guide rather than a perfectly accurate description of the situation at the present time.

2) Employment status not only depends on demographic factors but may be affected by other variables, such as income, way of life, social status or social culture, etc.

Prince of Songkla University
Pattani Campus